### Neuromorphic Computing - Memristors -



### J. Grollier

### Unité Mixte de Physique CNRS/Thales Palaiseau, France











### Outline

- **1- memristor devices : introduction**
- 2- memristors as digital memory
- **3- memristors for logic applications**
- **4- memristors for neuromorphic computing**

### Outline

- **1- memristor devices : introduction**
- 2- memristors as digital memory
- **3- memristors for logic applications**
- **4-** memristors for neuromorphic computing

### Memristor

L. O. Chua, "memristor – the missing circuit element" IEEE Trans. Circuit Theory (1971)

 $\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{M}(\mathbf{q}) \mathbf{i}$ 

M(q) = R(q) continuously tunable between  $R_{ON}$  and  $R_{OFF}$ 









### **Hewlett-Packard Memristor**



*displacement proportional to the charge*  $x \propto q \implies M(q) \cong R_{OFF} \left[ 1 - \mu \frac{R_{ON}}{L^2} q \right]$ 

Strukov, Snider, Stewart & Williams, Nature 453 (2008)

### **Hewlett-Packard Memristor**

L. O. Chua, "memristor – the missing circuit element" IEEE Trans. Circuit Theory (1971)

 $\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{M}(\mathbf{q}) \mathbf{i}$ 

M is a resistance that "remembers" how much current was injected, and how long continuously tunable between R<sub>ON</sub> and R<sub>OFF</sub>



the HP memristor



ions electromigration

Yang et al., Nature Nano (2008)



### Memristor

#### Memristor =

- Nano resistance
- Tunable (multi-states of resistance available)
- Non volatile
- Non-linear : V < V<sub>th</sub> read, V > V<sub>th</sub> write



### **Memristor technologies**

After (and even before) Hewlett-Packard TiO<sub>2</sub> memristor was proposed, many other very different memristor concepts were identified :

Erokhin et al., Surface and thin films (2007) PANI A.A. Zakhidov et al., Organic elec. (2009) metal/mixed conductor/metal F. Alibart et al., Advanced Func. Mater. (2009) Pentacene + gold particles Ben Jamaa et al., IEEE Nano (2009) Poly-cristalline Si nanowires Derycke et al., TNT (2009) Carbone nanotubes Driscol et al., APL (2009) Phase change material Gergel et al., IEEE EL (2009) flexible TiO2 Jo et al., Nanoletters (2009) Ag/Si Wang et al., IEEE EL (2009) spintronics Kim et al., Nanoletters (2009) nanoparticle assemblies Jeong et al., Nanoletters (2010) graphene Lee et al., Nature Materials (2011) Ta2O5 Ohno et al., Nature Materials (2011) atomic switches Chanthbouala, Grollier et al., Nature Physics (2011) spintronics

In particular, all resistive switching devices are memristors

. . . .

### **Memristor classification**



### **Memristor classification**



### **Red-Ox memristors**



Resistance changes due to a mix of : reduction-oxidation processes, ionic motion, phase transition and thermal effects

### **Red-Ox memristors : TaO<sub>x</sub>**

#### M-J. Lee et al., Nature Mat. 2011



# Formation of conductive filaments

### Pt/TaO<sub>x</sub>/Pt

Szot, Waser et al., Nanotechnology 2011 : TiO<sub>2</sub>, a prototypical memristive material

The physics of the  $Pt/TiO_2/Pt$  memristor is not as simple as originally described by HP team : filaments / phase change

### **Red-Ox memristors : atomic switch**



Diffusion of Ag<sup>+</sup> cations and reduction to Ag

Hasegawa, Aono et al, Adv Mater 2012

### **Red-Ox memristors : co-sputtered Ag/Si**



No forming process

Continuous propagation of the conductive front

### **Memristor classification**



### **Phase change memristors**



Phase change memristor : unipolar switching  $\rightarrow$  complications <sub>13</sub>

### **Memristor classification**



### **Organic Memristor**

• Organic memristors : NOMFET (polymer), CNT-FET, PANI....

- *additional functionalities ex : interaction with light* 

- bottom up approach ex : self-organization

- high density



Erokhin et al., NanoNet 2009

- very promising

- time scale > 10 years

Physical origin : charge trapping effects problem of memory retention time (< 1 h)

The gold nanoparticles = nanoscale capacitance to store the electric charge Transistor transconductance tuned by charge amount

F. Alibart et al., Advanced Func. Mater. (2009)



### **Memristor classification**



### **Purely electronic effects memristors**



• defect-mediated : thermal effects, ionic motion

ex : HP memristor based on electromigration : reliability / endurance issues

- large local heating
- need of a forming step
- physics not understood
- promising

### **Purely electronic effects memristors**



obtain memristive effects by purely electronic physical mechanisms

### Spintronic memristor (MRAM based)

#### A. Chanthbouala, J. Grollier, R. Matsumoto, V. Cros, A. Anane, A. V. Khvalkovskiy, A. Fert

Unité Mixte de Physique CNRS/Thales, France

#### K.A. Zvezdin

A.M. Prokhorov General Physics Institute of RAS, Russia Istituto P.M. s.r.l., Italy

#### K. Nishimura, Y. Nagamine, H. Maehara, K. Tsunekawa

Process Development Center, Canon ANELVA Corporation, Japan

#### A. Fukushima, and S. Yuasa

National Institute of Advanced Industrial Science and Technology (AIST), Japan









### **Spintronic memristor**

Magnetic tunnel junction



Ferromagnetic metal 1 - free Thin insulator ~ 1-2 nm thick Ferromagnetic metal 2 - fixed

~ 20 – 300 nm

Changing the magnetic configuration = changing the resistance



#### **Tunnel Magneto-Resistance (TMR)**

### **MTJ : controlling the resistance**





- Will be used to store information in the future STT-MRAM (Magnetic Random Access Memory)
- out to market in < 5y</li>
- Target : D-RAM applications

### **Spintronic memristor**



 $\rightarrow$  sub-ns switching

### **Ferroelectric memristor**

André Chanthbouala<sup>1</sup>, Vincent Garcia<sup>1</sup>, Arnaud Crassous<sup>1</sup>, Ryan Chérifi<sup>1</sup>, Karim Bouzehouane<sup>1</sup>, Stéphane Fusil<sup>1</sup>, Xavier Moya<sup>2</sup>, Stéphane Xavier<sup>3</sup>, Cyrile Deranlot<sup>1</sup>, Neil Mathur<sup>2</sup>, Manuel Bibes<sup>1</sup>, Julie Grollier<sup>1</sup> & Agnès Barthélémy<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Unité Mixte de Physique CNRS-Thales, Palaiseau, France <sup>2</sup>Department of Materials Science, University of Cambridge, UK <sup>3</sup>Thales Research and Technology, Palaiseau, France











### **Ferroelectric memristor**

#### Switching of the polarization with an electric field



**Ferroelectrics** 





**Ferroelectric tunnel junctions** 



Garcia et al., Nature 460, 81 (2009)

### Ferroelectric vs Resistive switching



### Outline

- **1- memristor devices : introduction**
- 2- memristors as digital memory
- **3- memristors for logic applications**
- **4- memristors for neuromorphic computing**

### **Memristors as memory**

## Hewlett-Packard annouced ReRAM out on the market in 2013 !

# Last 5 years : large improvements of memristor devices performance

- $\rightarrow$  switching speed
- $\rightarrow$  endurance, reliability etc.

### Memristors as memory : switching speed

IOP PUBLISHING

Nanotechnology 22 (2011) 485203 (7pp)

NANOTECHNOLOGY

#### doi:10.1088/0957-4484/22/48/485203

# Sub-nanosecond switching of a tantalum oxide memristor

#### Antonio C Torrezan, John Paul Strachan, Gilberto Medeiros-Ribeiro and R Stanley Williams



### 100 ps !



**Figure 4.** Fast (a) ON switching and (b) OFF switching of a 2  $\mu$ m memristor over five consecutive cycles. The voltage across the sample  $V_{\text{sample}}$  and the sample current data  $I_{\text{sample}}$  are displayed as dashed and solid lines, respectively. The inset in (a) shows the low bias current–voltage sweep of the device resistance state after each SET and RESET operation.

### **Memristors as memory : endurance**

#### mature materials

ARTICLES

PUBLISHED ONLINE: 10 JULY 2011 | DOI: 10.1038/NMAT3070

#### A fast, high-endurance and scalable non-volatile memory device made from asymmetric $Ta_2O_{5-x}/TaO_{2-x}$ bilayer structures

Myoung-Jae Lee<sup>1</sup>\*, Chang Bum Lee<sup>1</sup>, Dongsoo Lee<sup>1</sup>, Seung Ryul Lee<sup>1</sup>, Man Chang<sup>1</sup>, Ji Hyun Hur<sup>1</sup>, Young-Bae Kim<sup>1</sup>, Chang-Jung Kim<sup>1</sup>\*, David H. Seo<sup>1</sup>, Sunae Seo<sup>2</sup>, U-In Chung<sup>1</sup>, In-Kyeong Yoo<sup>1</sup> and Kinam Kim<sup>3</sup>









| Technology  | PCM              | <b>Red-Ox</b>      | FeTJ               | STT                  |
|---|------------------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------------|
| digital memristor   |                  |                    |                    |                      |
| Gain, Signal/Noise ratio                                    | N/A              |                    |                    |                      |
| Non-linearity   |                  |                    |                    |                      |
| Speed   | 50 ns            | 10 ns              | 10 ns              | 25 ns                |
| Power consumption   | 6 pJ             | < 1 pJ             | 10 fJ              | 0.02-5pJ             |
| Architecture/Integrability                                  | 6 F <sup>2</sup> | 5/8 F <sup>2</sup> | 5/8 F <sup>2</sup> | 20/40 F <sup>2</sup> |
| (Inputs/outputs, digital,<br>multilevel, analog, size etc.) |                  |                    |                    |                      |
| Other specific properties                                   |                  |                    |                    |                      |
| prototypes  | commercial       | some               |                    | yes                  |
| forming step  | no               | some               | no                 | no                   |
| switching   | unipolar         | both               | bipolar            | bipolar              |
| good theoretical understanding                              | yes              | no                 | yes                | yes                  |
| Manufacturability   | CMOS compatible  |                    |                    |                      |
| Timeline  | available        | < 5 v              | 9                  | < 3 v                |
| (When exploitable or when foreseen in production)           |                  | < 5 y              | ÷                  | < 5 y                |

### **Memristors as memory : arrays**

• Challenges for memory to replace Flash & SRAM:

→ Scale down below 15 nm
+ low power, high speed, dense, non-volatile

• Memristor devices can be scaled down below 20 nm

 $\rightarrow$  filament, atomic switch intrisically small

• 1 memory element = 1 storage device – 1 selector

→ limiting element : selector ?

• High enough OFF/On ratio : possibility to remove the selector

→ crossbar array ( $10^3 \times 10^3 \rightarrow OFF/ON$  ratio  $10^7$ )

→ or combine memristor type 1 : storage, memristor type 2 : selector

### **Memristors as memory SWOT**

| Strengths<br>• Scalability<br>• Non-volatility<br>• Multilevel<br>• Cost    | <ul> <li>Weaknesses</li> <li>physics ?</li> <li>forming step (to be removed)</li> <li>reliability / endurance</li> </ul>   |
|---|--|
| <b>Opportunities</b><br>• crossbar arrays (no selector)<br>• 3D integration | <ul> <li>Threats</li> <li>defects when scaling down</li> <li>reliability</li> <li>need to find agreement on the best technology (TiO<sub>2</sub>, TaO<sub>2</sub>, Atomic switch, Spintronic, Ferroelectric etc.)</li> </ul> |

### Outline

- **1- memristor devices : introduction**
- 2- memristors as digital memory
- **3- memristors for logic applications**
- **4-** memristors for neuromorphic computing
### **Memristors for logic**

If the OFF/ON ratio is large enough, memristors could be used as latches (replacing transistors)

#### - logic functions

Kuekes et al., JAP 2005 Borghetti et al., Nature 2010



#### - Reconfigurable Architectures

(Field Programmable Gate Arrays) *Snider et al., Nanotechnology 2007* Field Programmable Nanowire Interconnect



#### A particularly good candidate is the atomic switch

FPNI

### **Memristors for logic : atomic switch**



www.advmat.de



www.MaterialsViews.com

Tsuyoshi Hasegawa,\* Kazuya Terabe, Tohru Tsuruoka, and Masakazu Aono



**Figure 7.** Logic gates configured by gap-type atomic switches in a crossbar circuit. (a) AND gate, (b) OR gate and (c) NOT gate. Reproduced with permission.<sup>[15]</sup> Copyright 2005, NPG.

### **Memristors for logic : circuits**

IOP PUBLISHING

NANOTECHNOLOGY

Nanotechnology 21 (2010) 235203 (6pp)

doi:10.1088/0957-4484/21/23/235203

# A memristor-based nonvolatile latch circuit

Warren Robinett, Matthew Pickett, Julien Borghetti, Qiangfei Xia, Gregory S Snider, Gilberto Medeiros-Ribeiro and R Stanley Williams

Hewlett Packard Labs, Palo Alto, CA, USA

# A hybrid nanomemristor/transistor logic circuit capable of self-programming

Julien Borghetti, Zhiyong Li, Joseph Straznicky, Xuema Li, Douglas A. A. Ohlberg, Wei Wu, Duncan R. Stewart, and R. Stanley Williams<sup>1</sup>

**HP PNAS 2009** 

### **Memristors for logic SWOT**

#### Weaknesses **S**trengths • need to improve OFF/ON ratio low power • physics ? • speed non-volatility **O**pportunities Threats possibility of 3T devices (ex not endurant enough atomic switch) new reconfigurable architectures • logic in memory

### Outline

- **1- memristor devices : introduction**
- 2- memristors as digital memory
- **3- memristors for logic applications**
- 4- memristors for neuromorphic computing



#### • Human brain

| parallel architecture     | analog |
|---------------------------|--------|
| 10 <sup>11</sup> neurons  | 10 Hz  |
| 10 <sup>15</sup> synapses | 20 W   |



• Simulations of mouse cortex on Blue Gene L

| Von-Neumann architecture    | digital     |
|-----------------------------|-------------|
| 8.10 <sup>4</sup> neurons   | 1 GHz       |
| 5.10 <sup>10</sup> synapses | 40 kW       |
| super-computers slower than | mouse (×10) |



• Advantages of parallel, analog architecture speed, low energy consumption, defect tolerance



### **Artificial Neural Networks (ANNs)**





inputs

neuron

### **Artificial Neural Networks (ANNs)**



- $w_{ij}$  : synaptic weights
  - network memory
  - efficiency to transmit information
  - adjustable = **plasticity** = learning

parallel, analog architecture : speed, low energy consumption, defect tolerance



*synapse* W<sub>ii</sub> outputs

Before 1990 Attempts to build such architectures in hardware

• huge

interconnectivity

But could not keep up with the boom of GPUs



### **Artificial Neural Networks (ANNs)**



this is no longer true :

### the time is ripe to build neuromorphic chips















































### **Hardware ANNs : applications**



Hardware ANNs : good at certain tasks Classical architectures : good at other tasks

### • Hybrid architectures Von Neumann / ANN

heterogenous multi-core, embedded applications Goal : accelerating specific tasks example : digital camera, accelerate smile recognition voice recognition...



# • Large scale hardware simulations of the human brain ?

faster and less power consumption than supercomputer simulations Goal : understanding the human brain cf : european projects FACETS/Brainscales & Human Brain flagship project



### **Criteria for artificial synapses**





- synapses should have a memory : the weights have to be stored (non-volatility)
- synapses should be small : 10<sup>4</sup> synapses/neuron in human brain
- synapses should be plastic : synaptic plasticity

<u>Biological synapse</u> : change in strength in response to either use or disuse of transmission <u>Artificial synapses</u> : the weigths  $w_{ij}$  should be adjustable

a learning rule specifies how to adjust the weights for a given input/output pair



### **Memristors : artificial synapses**

#### • Memristors have a memory : they directly store the synaptic weights (*w* = *conductance*)

Non-volative multi-valued resistances

OFF R SET RESET ON Stimulus

no need for space consuming SRAM banks to store the weights CMOS artificial synapse made at Kirchhoff Institute



Schemmel et al., IJCNN 2006



#### • Memristors are small (< 50 x 50 nm<sup>2</sup>)

interconnection issue : about 10<sup>4</sup> synapses per neuron in the brain

ex : CMOS "neurons" + memristive "synapses"



memristor crossbar arrays

No demonstration yet of operational mixed memristor/CMOS cognitive chip

to be solved : cross-talk, sneak paths, lithography



### **Memristors : crossbar arrays**

## NANO LETTERS 2011

LETTER

pubs.acs.org/NanoLett

#### Flexible Memristive Memory Array on Plastic Substrates

Seungjun Kim, $^{+}$  Hu Young Jeong, $^{+,\$}$  Sung Kyu Kim, $^{+}$  Sung-Yool Choi, $^{+,\perp}$  and Keon Jae Lee $^{*,+}$ 

<sup>†</sup>Department of Materials Science and Engineering, Korea Advanced Institute of Science and Technology (KAIST), 291 Daehak-ro, Yuseong-gu, Daejeon 305-701, Republic of Korea

<sup>†</sup>Electronics and Telecommunications Research Institute (ETRI), Daejeon 305-700, Republic of Korea

### **TiO<sub>2</sub> 8 x 8**



#### A Functional Hybrid Memristor Crossbar-Array/CMOS System for Data Storage and Neuromorphic Applications

Kuk-Hwan Kim,<sup>†</sup> Siddharth Gaba,<sup>†</sup> Dana Wheeler,<sup>‡</sup> Jose M. Cruz-Albrecht,<sup>‡</sup> Tahir Hussain,<sup>‡</sup> Narayan Srinivasa,<sup>‡</sup> and Wei Lu<sup>\*,†</sup>

<sup>†</sup>Electrical Engineering and Computer Science, The University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109, United States <sup>‡</sup>HRL Laboratories LLC, 3011 Malibu Canyon Road, Malibu, California 90265-4797, United States

#### Si/Ag 40 x 40

#### Small demonstrators exist





## **Memristors : artificial synapses**

 $\Delta t > 0$ 

#### • Memristors directly implement the synaptic plasticity $\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{M}(\mathbf{q}) \mathbf{i}$

M(q) is continuously tunable between  $R_{ON}$  and  $R_{OFF}$ 

No need for space consuming complicated CMOS circuits

CMOS synapse emulating a learning rule called : Spike Timing Dependent Plasticity (STDP)

 $\Lambda t < 0$ 

enable

**1 memristor directly implements STDP** 







• Jo et al., Nanoletters 2010

• Linarres-Barranco et al., Frontiers in Neuroscience, 2011



**STDP : experimental implementation** 









### **Atomic switch**



#### Ohno, Aono *et al.*, Nature Mat. 2011

Short term versus long term memory



## neuromorphic architectures

- inspiration from biology and cell signalling process
- different levels of abstraction
  - $\rightarrow$  at the cell level (neuron)
  - $\rightarrow$  at the molecular level (biochemival reaction)

#### • common points

- $\rightarrow$  massively parallel
- → take advantage of the noise (stochasticity)
- common challenges
  - $\rightarrow$  interconnect
  - $\rightarrow$  programming
  - $\rightarrow$  communication with classical computing architectures

# **Neuromorphic Computing SWOT**

### $\pmb{S} trengths$

- speed
- low power
- defect tolerance

#### Weaknesses

- interconnect
- programming
- design : to be invented
- control device stochasticity

### **O**pportunities

- use differently memory devices
- accelerators for specific functions to interface in heterogeneous multicore architectures
- adaptive architectures, able to compute with incomplete data  $\rightarrow$  robotics, unmanned vehicles etc.

#### Threats

- the density cannot be reached
- the interconnection problem cannot be solved
- heat management

#### MemCo Workhop "Memristors for Computing"



19-21 November 2012, Fréjus, France

#### INVITED SPEAKERS

- M. Di Ventra (UC San Diego, USA)
- Y. Frégnac (UNIC, Gif s.Yvette, FRA)
- V. Garcia (CNRS/Thales, Palaiseau, FRA)
- T. Hasegawa (Nims MANA, Tsukuba, JAP)
- B. Jackson (IBM Almaden, USA)
- D. Kuzum (Stanford Univ., USA)
- B. Linares-Barranco (IMSE Sevilla, SPA)

- W. Lu (Univ. of Michigan, USA)
- T. Prodromakis (Imperial College London, UK)
- D. Querlioz (IEF Orsay, FRA)
- D. Strukov (UCSB, USA)
- S. Thorpe (CerCo, Toulouse, FRA)
- S. Williams (Hewlett Packard, Palo Alto, USA)
- D. Wright (Exeter University, UK)

Inscriptions and abstract submission deadline : July, 31st 2012

http://www.trt.thalesgroup.com/ump-cnrs-thales/memco



- Many opportunities for memristors
- Same device / different ways to compute with it

 $\rightarrow$  exploit multi-functionality





### **Hebbian learning**

### • Learning rule :

- « Neurons that fire together wire together » Hebb, 1949
- Spike timing dependent plasticity :



#### - causality is important:

transmission enhanced if post-neuron fires after pre-neuron

- timing is important :
- $-\Delta T$  small, large transmission changes

### Spike timing dependent plasticity



change of conductance vs. applied voltage :



### Spike timing dependent plasticity

### Memristor change of conductance (synapse weight)

Linarres-Barranco et al., frontiers in Neuroscience, 2011





conductance increase **potentiation** 



depression


# **STDP curve vs action potential shape**

Linarres-Barranco et al., frontiers in Neuroscience, 2011



possibility to implement different kinds of STDP with a single device

**STDP** allows unsupervised learning (image recognition etc.)



# **STDP : experimental implementation**





Jo et al., Nanoletters 2010

# **STDP : experimental implementation**

(a) (b) Memristor Ag + Si Synapse To pre-neuron To post-neuron





 US : 2009 DARPA "SyNAPSE" program
 Systems of Neuromorphic Adaptive Plastic Scalable Electronics
 define a new path forward for creating
 useful, intelligent machines
 3 funded projects (~ 5 M\$ each for the first phase)

- Hewlett-Packard (memristors) - HRL labs (memristors) - IBM (?)

### • Europe :

FP7 Nabab, FP7 Bion (ended) ERC NanoBrain & ERC Femmes projects, Chist-Era PNEUMA



• State of the art memristor : exciting potential of memristor devices as artificial synapse

• spintronic memristor : resistance switching based on purely electronic effects

> very promising : endurance, speed, power consumption

• Young topic : no demonstration yet of a cognitive chip based on memristors

- Dedicated architectures and programmation schemes to be developed
- Which type of memristor for which application ?



### **Funding**:

- ERC Starting Grant 259068 Nanobrain

- ANR P2N MHANN « Memristive Hardware Artificial neural Networks Accelerators »

- PEPS project ACME « Memristive Accelerators »

|                      | Volatile                  |  | Non-volatile                     |   |                                       |                   |                                     |
|----------------------|---------------------------|--|----------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|-------------------|-------------------------------------|
|                      |                           |  | NAND                             | Trapping                                  |                                       |                   |                                     |
|                      | DRAM                      | SRAM                                       | Flash                            | charge                                    | FERAM                                 | MRAM              | PCM                                 |
| Storage<br>mechanism | Charge<br>on<br>capacitor | Interlock<br>ed state<br>of logic<br>gates | Charge<br>on<br>floating<br>gate | Charge<br>trapped in<br>gate<br>insulator | Ferroel<br>ectric<br>polariz<br>ation | Magnetiz<br>ation | Amorphous<br>/cristalline<br>phases |
| Cell elements        | 1T1C                      | 6T   | 1T                               | 1T  | 1T1C                                  | 1(2)⊤1C           | 1T1R                                |
| Feature size<br>(nm) | 50                        | 65   | 90                               | 50  | 180                                   | 130               | 65                                  |
| Cell area            | 6F <sup>2</sup>           | 140F <sup>2</sup>                          | 5F <sup>2</sup>                  | 6F <sup>2</sup>                           | 22F <sup>2</sup>                      | 45F <sup>2</sup>  | 16F <sup>2</sup>                    |
| W/E time             | <10 ns                    | 0.3 ns                                     | 0.1 ms                           | 20 µs                                     | 10 ns                                 | 20 ns             | 50 ns                               |
| Retention<br>time    | 64 ms                     | 0  | > 10 y                           | > 10 y                                    | > 10 y                                | >10 y             | >10 y                               |
| Write cycles         | >1E16                     | >1E16                                      | >1E5                             | >1E5                                      | 1.00E+<br>14                          | >1E16             | 1.00E+09                            |
| Write voltage        | 2.5                       | 2.5  | 15                               | 8   | 0.9-3.3                               | 1.5               | 3                                   |
| Read voltage         | 1.8                       | 1  | 2                                | 1.6                                       | 0.9-3.3                               | 1.5               | 3                                   |
| Write energy         | 5 fJ                      | 0.7 fJ                                     | 10 fJ                            | 100 fJ                                    | 30 fJ                                 | 100 pJ            | 6 pJ                                |



#### R. Waser, ISIF 2011